

Respiration Rate Modelling of Royal Delicious Apple at Different Storage Temperatures

Shukadev Mangaraj^{1,2*} • Tridib Kumar Goswami¹

Department of Agricultural and Food Engineering, Indian Institute of Technology, Kharagpur, West Bengal, India 721 302
 Permanent address: Scientist (SS), CIAE, Nabibagh, Berasia Road, Bhopa-462038 (M.P.), India

Corresponding author: * tkg@agfe.iitkgp.ernet.in

ABSTRACT

Temperature is the most important factor that controls the rate of respiration of fruits and vegetables. Several experiments were conducted at different storage temperatures to generate respiration data using a closed system method for respiration measurement. Two different models based on regression analysis and enzyme kinetics were developed. In the model based on enzyme kinetics the Arrhenius equation was proposed for predicting the respiration rates of Royal Delicious apple as a function of O_2 and CO_2 concentrations and storage temperature. In the enzyme kinetics model, the dependence of respiration rate on O_2 and CO_2 was found to follow an uncompetitive inhibition. The regression coefficient values were used for the prediction of respiration rates using regression model. The enzyme kinetic model parameters, calculated from the respiration rate at different O_2 and CO_2 concentrations were used to fit the Arrhenius equation against different storage temperatures. The activation energy and respiration pre-exponential factor were used to predict the model parameters of enzyme kinetics at any storage temperature between 0-30°C. The developed models were verified for goodness of fit at 12°C and found to be in close agreement with the experimentally estimated respiration rates.

Keywords: enzyme kinetics, fruit maturity, fruit ripening, gas analysis, regression analysis **Abbreviations:** CA, controlled atmosphere; MA, modified atmosphere

INTRODUCTION

Apple (Malus pumila Mill.) is native of eastern Europe and Western Asia and has been cultivated from pre-historic times. It is a highly remunerative deciduous fruit grown in temperate region (Kaushal and Sharma 1995). Scandinavians considered apple as the food of gods. It is a fleshy fruit with tough skin, ranging in color from greenish yellow to red (Prasad 1995; Mahajan 2001). The world production of apple is presently about 45 million tones, 71% of which is consumed as fresh apple while about 20% is processed into value added products of which 65% are processed into Apple Juice Concentrate (AJC) and the balance quantity into other products which include packed natural RTS apple juice, apple wine and cider, apple purees and jams, dried apple products, etc. (http://www.geocities.com/ perfectapple/prod.html; http://mofpi.nic.in/apple.pdf). The leading apple growing country is China, producing about 41% of the world's apples, followed by the United States, Turkey, France, Poland, Italy, the Russian Federation, Ger-many, Argentina, India, Japan and Chile. Even warmer countries like Iraq and Mexico are able to grow apples in their cooler upland regions (Kaushal and Sharma 1995; http://www.geocities.com/perfectapple/prod.html). The production of apple in China is 20 million tonnes which is equivalent to the combined production of 9 top producing countries of the world. China and Poland are the two largest apple exporting countries with each of them exporting about 180,000 MT per year while USA and Germany are the two largest importers of AJC with an import of 300,000 tonnes of each, besides being very large producers themselves which indicate that their per capita consumption of apple juice is very large (http://mofpi.nic.in/apple.pdf).

Apple was introduced to India by the British in Kullu Valley of the Himalayan State of Himachal Pradesh (H.P.) as far back as 1865, while the colored delicious cultivars of apple were introduced to the Shimla Hills of the same state in 1917 (Ghosh 1999). India is the ninth largest producer of fresh apple in the world with a production quantity of about 1.30 million tonnes with the cultivated area of 0.24 million ha, but produces only 4500 tonnes per annum of AJC which is equivalent to about 0.64% of the total world production (http://mofpi.nic.in/apple.pdf; http://www.applejournal.com/ India001.htm). It is the 7th most widely grown fruit crop in India (http://agricoop.nic.in/hort/hortrevo5.htm). The apple fruits are grown in the North-Western Indian States of Jammu and Kashmir (J&K), Himachal Pradesh (H.P.), Uttar Pradesh (U.P.) hills and in the north eastern hill regions in the states of Arunachal Pradesh, Nagaland, Meghalaya and Manipur (Chadha 1978; Ghosh 1999). J&K is leading in the production and productivity of apple in India followed by H.P. and U.P. (Ghosh 1999).

The delicious group of cultivars predominates the apple market. The areas covered under the delicious cultivars of apple in India are 83% of the area under apple in H.P., 45% in J&K and 30% in U.P. hills (Ghosh 1999). The most popular varieties of apple grown in India are Royal Delicious, Red Delicious, Golden Delicious, Rich Red, Red Gold, Granny Smith, Macintosh, Benoni, Irish Peach, Cox's Orange Pipin, Ambri, American Apirouge, Tydemans's Early, Mollies Delicious, Red Spur, Top Red, Red Chief, Early Shanburry, Chaubattia Princes, Rymer and Buckingham etc. (Ghosh 1999; Mangaraj and Varshney 2006). The apples are graded into seven grades on the basis of size and color. The size parameter is equatorial diameter (E.D.) of fruit. The seven grades includes super large (E.D. = 8.5 cm), extra large (8 cm), large (7.5 cm), medium (7 cm), small (6.5 cm), extra small (6 cm) and pitto (5.5 cm), etc. (Kaushal and Anand 1986; Varshney et al. 2002).

Royal Delicious apple (50-60%) and Red Delicious apples (20-30%) account for 70-80% of the total production of apple in India. Both the varieties of apple have delicious

flavors, goodness, attractive color, sweet delicious taste and great market demand. The distinguish features of these varieties are: (i) the red delicious apple are long, conical shape and light red color whereas the Royal Delicious are large and conical; (ii) the red delicious apple have yellow skin covered with red strip but not all over the surface, however, the Royal Delicious have yellow skin covered with red strips all over the surface; (iii) the red delicious apple have determined calyx lobes but the Royal Delicious have not prominent calyx bobes (Varshney et al. 2002); (iv) the red delicious apple can be stored at room temperature for 25-30 days but the Royal Delicious apple's storage life is shorter, i.e. around 20 days; (v) the keeping quality of red delicious apple in ambient storage is better than the Royal Delicious apple etc. (Singh et al. 1978; Ingale and D'Souza 1989). India presently exports 7000 tons of apples, which is 6% of total fresh fruit export, mostly to Bangladesh and Sri Lanka. Apple like royal and red delicious, Ambri and other new colored cultivar are suitable for the export market (Ghosh 1999). The Royal Delicious apples contribute maximum percentage in total production, high quality and export oriented. However the storage period and keeping quality is not of that standard. Hence it prompted us for the respiration kinetic study of Royal Delicious apple at different temperatures for its suitability for design of modified and control atmosphere storage system.

Storage of agricultural commodities such as Royal Delicious apple has many aims, but the main objective is to prolong their availability on the market throughout the year. Certain post harvest constraints like shelf life; susceptibility to many diseases and pest; faster fruit ripening at warmer temperatures etc. limits its storage condition (Kaul and Gupta 1987; Kaushal and Sharma 1995). Apple Scab is considered the most dreaded diseases of apple and is reported from almost all the apple growing regions of the world (Gupta 1987). Decay and disorders such as Jonathan spot and bitter pit are worst at storage temperatures higher than – 1 to 0°C (Kaushal and Sharma 1995). For most apple cultivars, the optimum storage temperature is -1 to 0° C with 90-95% relative humidity. For a cultivar such as delicious, storage at -1°C will give approximately 25% longer storage life than at 0°C (Kaushal and Sharma 1999). Some apples often develop soft scald in regular cold storage at 0°C, and hence, they should be stored at 2-30°C. Yellow Newton apples grown in California often develop internal browning when stored at 30°C; their optimum storage period is 3-4°C Storage of Jonathan apples in control atmosphere storage at 0°C provides good control of soft scald and Jonathan spot (Kaushal and Sharma 1995). Many researchers have studied the influence of altered atmosphere on the commodity storage life. Two main types of altered atmosphere are modified and controlled atmosphere (MA and CA). The use of these methods provides some control of fruit and vegetable ripening, retardation of senescence, or browning in cut produce (Stiles 1991) and ultimately prolongs the shelf life. Depending on the specific commodity needs, MA and CA can prolong market availability of the produce up to the next harvest.

Fruit transpiration and respiration are affected by atmospheric composition and temperature (Fonseca et al. 2002). Temperature has been identified as the most important external factor influencing respiration. Biological reactions generally increase two to three times for every 10°C rise in temperature within the range of temperature normally encountered in distribution and marketing chain (Burzo 1980; Zagory and Kader 1988; Kader et al. 1989; Irtwange 2006). At higher temperatures, enzymatic denaturation may occur and reduce respiration rates. If temperatures are too low, physiological injury may occur, which may lead to an increase in respiration rates (Fidler and North 1967). At lower temperature the respiration rates is considerably less and the shelf life can be increased. Hence for prolonging the shelf-life of agricultural commodity, appropriate temperature control is the key to the design of any storage system. Also, accurate measurement and modeling

of respiration rates is central to the design of MA/CA for agricultural commodity (Kader *et al.* 1989; Mahajan 2001; Fonseca *et al.* 2002).

Respiration is a metabolic process that provides the energy for plant biochemical processes. Various substrates used in important synthetic metabolic pathways in the plant are formed during respiration (Meyer *et al.* 1973). Aerobic respiration consists of oxidative breakdown of organic reserves to simpler molecules, including carbon dioxide (CO_2) and water, with release of energy. The organic substrates broken down in this process may include carbohydrates, lipids, and organic acids. The process consumes oxygen (O_2) in a series of enzymatic reactions. Due to these metabolic processes in fruits, which continue even after harvest, the shelf life of the product is reduced. However, the rates of these metabolic processes are generally directly proportional to the storage temperature, thus increasing the shelf life to a certain level at lower temperatures.

Measurement of respiration rate of produce at a particular storage temperature and gas composition is time consuming and needs special equipments for gas analysis. Various mathematical models have been developed to correlate the respiration rate with different storage parameters such as gas composition i.e. O₂ and CO₂ and temperature. Yang and Chinnan (1988) studied the influence of O_2 and CO_2 concentrations and storage time on the respiration rates of tomato. The effect of temperature on respiration rate was not considered in their models. The models adequately predicted the respiration rate of tomatoes stored in a controlled atmosphere. Lee et al. (1991) suggested an enzyme kinetics theory for modeling of respiration rate. Cameron et al. (1989) used an empirical approach to measure the respiration rate as a function of O_2 concentration by observing the rate of O_2 depletion in a closed system. Talasila *et al.* (1992) developed a non-linear empirical model for predicting the respiration rate of strawberry as a function of temperature, O_2 and CO_2 concentration. However, due to the specificity of the model parameters, the same need to be identified and quantified for each fruit and vegetable product. Keeping in view the aforesaid information, the objective of the present work was to determine the respiration rate of Royal Delicious apple at different temperatures by close system respirometer study and to develop and test suitable mathematical models to predict the respiration rate of apple as a function of O₂ and CO₂ concentrations and the storage temperature.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Fruit material

Fresh mature apple fruit of local popular variety Royal Delicious was obtained from an orchard at Kulu (Himachal Pradesh), India. Fruits were washed to remove adhering dirt, and used for the study. Care was taken to ensure that the fruits were of uniform size and weight.

Physico-chemical properties of fruits

As practiced in most of the orchards in developing countries like India, fruit maturity is assessed by an experienced orchard person, subjectively (Mahajan 2001). Nevertheless, the physical and chemical properties were also determined objectively in the laboratory prior to the respiration rate study. Initial apple fruit color and firmness was determined using Hunter Lab Colorimeter and Texture analyzer respectively (Mahajan 2001). The weight of apple fruits was measured using a precision balance (Essae Teraoka, Japan) having an accuracy of 0.01 g. True volume, ascorbic acid, total soluble solids and titrable acidity of apple fruits were determined as per the methods described by Ranganna (1995). All the physical and chemical properties were determined for 10 representative samples and the average values were presented.



Fig. 1 Schematic sketch for the closed system method for generation of respiration data.

Gas exchange measurement

Respiration rates can be measured by observing the concentration of O₂ consumption or CO₂ evolution per unit time per unit weight of the produce. Various external factors such as O2 concentration, CO_2 concentration, temperature and time affect respiration (Kays 1991; Lee et al. 1991; Hagger et al. 1992; Prasad 1995; Mahajan 2001). Measurement of O_2 consumption by the fruit tissue as a function of O₂ and CO₂ concentration in a flow through system is technically difficult, since it requires highly accurate analytical equipment (Cameron et al. 1989). Hence the respiration rate data for apple fruits was experimentally generated for different temperatures using the closed system method (Andrich et al. 1991; Song et al. 1992; Peppelenbos and Leven 1996; Dash 2007; Menon Bhande et al. 2008; Rekha and Goswami 2008) as described in Fig. 1. Closed systems can provide a convenient way of characterizing respiration of fresh produce in a single set of experiment (Kang et al. 1998; Hagger et al. 1992; Song et al. 1992; Hong and Kim 2001; Fonseca et al. 2002). In this process, the changes in O₂ and CO₂ concentrations resulting from respiration within a sealed container could be measured directly. Air-tight respirometer chambers of size 0.125 m \times 0.175 m \times 0.23 m made up of acrylic (Perspex) sheet was used. A Ni-Cr thermocouple was inserted into one side of the respirometer and used to measure the storage temperature. Fruits were kept in respirometer from the open topside and were closed with the lid while inserting neoprene gasket in between. Lid was closed with nuts and bolts provided on the respirometer to make it airtight. The system was kept in a humidity control chamber (Digitek System, Kolkata, India) which was maintained at the desired temperature with a tolerance limit of \pm 0.2°C and relative humidity of 92 \pm 2%. Gas composition of the respirometer was analyzed at regular intervals depending on the storage temperature of apple. Typically the intervals chosen were 2 h for the temperatures at 30 and 25°C, 4 h at 20 and 15°C, and 8 h at 10, 5 and 0°C, respectively. Gas analysis was done until the CO₂ concentration reached 18%, or until aerobic respiration persisted (Hagger et al. 1992). Changes in the concentration of O_2 and CO_2 over a certain period of time were measured and used to estimate respiration rates. After an interval of time, gas samples of the container were analyzed for O₂ and CO₂ concentration. Weight of fruits taken during the experiment and its corresponding free volume is shown in Table 1. Free volume of the respirometer was the total volume of the respirometer minus volume occupied by its content. The free volume of the respiration chamber (V_f) was determined by nitrogen injection method (Prasad 1995). For this a predetermined quantity (Q_N) of N_2 which could cause a measurable change in N_2 level of container's atmosphere was injected. The increased in N2 level was determined by analyzing the gas sample on gas chromatograph. By incorporating these values in the following equation, the free volume of the respiration container was calculated.

 Table 1 Physico-chemical properties of apple cv. Royal Delicious.

Parameter	Value*
Physical properties	
Fruit weight (g)	135.94 ± 10.15
Fruit volume (ml)	157.61 ± 12.44
True density (kg/m ³)	862.46 ± 22.32
Physical dimensions	
Major diameter (mm)	69.35 ± 6.12
Intermediate diameter (mm)	68.55 ± 2.25
Minor diameter (mm)	61.10 ± 2.45
Sphericity	0.96 ± 0.03
Firmness (g)	4600.20 ± 562.36
Puncture strength (g)	297.47 ± 34.65
Hunter Color parameters:	
L	33.93 ± 4.14
a	35.12 ± 3.25
b	10.95 ± 3.47
Hue	17.31 ± 1.74
Chroma	36.78 ± 1.82
Chemical properties	
Titrable acidity (% malic acid)	0.25 ± 0.02
Ascorbic acid (mg/100 ml of juice)	7.87 ± 0.75
Total soluble solids (°Brix)	12.26 ± 0.65
Starch-iodine index (1-9 scale)	4.50 ± 0.58

* Values presented are average of 10 representative apple fruits and \pm indicates the standard deviation.

$$V_{f} = \frac{Q_{N} \times 100}{\left(N_{f} - N_{i}\right)} \tag{1}$$

where, V_f is the free volume of the respiration chamber in cm³, Q_N is the volume of N_2 injected into the respiration chamber in cm³, N_i and N_f are the initial and final N_2 concentration in %.

Gas analysis

Storage gas sample of about 1 ml was taken periodically with an airtight syringe and was analyzed quantitatively for O_2 and CO_2 concentrations using gas chromatograph (GC model 100 Knaur, Germany). A column packed with Spherocarb (18-100 mesh, 1.83 m long) was used for separation of CO_2 , O_2 and nitrogen. Hydrogen was used as carrier gas at a flow rate of 25 ml/min. Oven temperature was kept at 50°C whereas injector and detector were set at 125 and 150°C, respectively with the detector voltage of 5 V. The sampling intervals were different for different storage temperatures as mentioned in the previous section. Each time three replications were taken for the gas analysis and the average gas composition was recorded. The respiration study was replicated in triplicate for accurate measurement and analysis.

Modelling and data analysis

The experimental respiration rate was calculated from the concentration difference, weight of fruit and free volume of the chamber. The respiration rates in terms of O_2 and CO_2 at a given temperature were calculated using the following equations (2) and (3) as given by Kays (1991).

$$R_{02} = \left[\frac{(Y_{02})_{t} - (Y_{02})_{t+1}}{\Delta t}\right] \frac{V_{f}}{W}$$
(2)

$$R_{CO2} = \left[\frac{(Z_{CO2})_{t+1} - (Z_{CO2})_t}{\Delta t}\right] \frac{V_f}{W}$$
(3)

where: R_{O2} is the respiration rate, ml $[O_2]$ kg⁻¹h⁻¹, R_{CO2} is the respiration rate, ml $[CO_2]$ kg⁻¹h⁻¹, Y_{O2} and Z_{CO2} are the gas concentrations for O_2 and CO_2 respectively, t is the storage time in h, Δt is the time difference between two gas measurements, V_f is the free volume of the respiration chamber in ml and W is the weight of the fruit in kg.

Two different approaches were attempted to model the respiration rate based on the experimental data as outlined below.

Model 1

A regression function is often used to fit the data of gas concentration versus time, and the respiration rate at given time is determined from the first derivative of the regression function (Cameron *et al.* 1989; Hagger *et al.* 1992; Mahajan and Goswami 2001). By using the generated experimental respiration data, a nonlinear regression analysis was done using SYSTAT 8.0 to fit O₂ concentration and CO₂ concentration at different storage periods. The resultant regression equations for O₂ consumption and CO₂ evolution are shown in equations (4) and (5) to determine the values of the coefficients 'a' and 'b'.

$$Y_{02} = 0.21 - \left[\frac{t}{a \times t + b}\right]$$
(4)

$$Z_{CO2} = \left[\frac{t}{a \times t + b}\right]$$
(5)

where: a and b are the regression coefficients; a is unit less and b is in h, t is storage period in h, Y_{O2} and Z_{CO2} are the gas concentrations for O_2 and CO_2 respectively in decimal.

The first derivative of the regression functions were used to determine the rate of change of gas concentration as outlined in equations (6) and (7).

$$\frac{d(Y_{O2})}{dt} = a \times t(a \times t + b)^{-2} - (a \times t + b)^{-1}$$
(6)

$$\frac{d(Z_{CO2})}{dt} = -a \times t(a \times t + b)^{-2} + (a \times t + b)^{-1}$$
(7)

The respiration rate of the sample at any given time was then calculated by substituting the values of dY_{O2}/dt and dZ_{CO2}/dt obtained from equations (6) and (7) in equation (8) and (9) respectively.

$$R_{O2} = -\frac{d[(Y_{O2})]}{dt} \frac{V_f}{W}$$
(8)

$$R_{\rm CO2} = -\frac{d[Z_{\rm CO2}]}{dt} \frac{V_{\rm f}}{W}$$
(9)

The temperature dependence of the model coefficients 'a' and 'b' were estimated by linear interpolation between the two temperatures.

Model 2

The principles of enzyme kinetics have been suggested as being applicable to the respiration rate of fresh produce and Michaelies-Menten equation has been fitted to respiration rates (Lee et al. 1991). Considering that CO₂ acts as a respiration inhibitor, the effect of CO₂ on the product respiration can be described by the un-competitive inhibition (Pepelenbos and Leven 1996; Maneerat et al. 1997; McLaughlin and O'Beirne 1999). The uncompetitive type of inhibition occurs where the inhibitor (CO_2) does not bind with the enzyme, but bind reversely with the enzyme-substrate complex, reducing the rate of product formation as in the case of Michaels-Menten type equation. In this case the increase of substrate concentration (O₂ concentration) at high CO₂ concentrations has almost no influence on the O₂ consumption rate i.e. increasing the substrate concentration cannot reverse it (Cornish-Bowden 1979). Thus the maximum respiration rate is not much influenced at high CO₂ concentration. At high levels of CO₂ concentration (17-18%), however the respiration mechanism changes form aerobic to anaerobic pathway (Mahajan 2001). Hence principles of enzyme kinetics with uncompetitive inhibition were used to develop a model (Hager et al. 1992; Lee et al. 1991; Song et al. 1992; Lee et al. 1996; Pepelenbos and Leven 1996; Mahajan and Goswami 2001; Menon Rekha and Goswami 2008) for predicting the rate of respiration of Royal Delicious apple fruits. The model has three parameters viz., $v_{\text{m}},\,k_{\text{m}},\,\text{and}\,\,k_{\text{i}}$ for both O_2 consumption and CO_2 evolution as shown in equation (10) and (11). The model parameters were determined using the experimental respiration data.

$$R_{02} = \frac{V_{m(02)} \times Y_{02}}{k_{m(02)} + \{1 + ([Z_{C02}]/k_{i(02)})\}Y_{02}}$$
(10)

$$R_{CO2} = \frac{V_{m(CO2)} \times Y_{O2}}{k_{m(CO2)} + \{l + ([Z_{CO2}]/k_{i(CO2)})\}Y_{O2}}$$
(11)

where: R_{O2} is the respiration rate, ml $[O_2]$ kg⁻¹h⁻¹, R_{CO2} is the respiration rate, ml $[CO_2]$ kg⁻¹h⁻¹, Y_{O2} and Z_{CO2} are the gas concentrations for O_2 and CO_2 respectively, $V_{m(O2)}$ and $V_{m(CO2)}$ are the maximum respiration rate for O_2 consumption and CO_2 evolution respectively, $K_{m(O2)}$ and $K_{m(CO2)}$ are the Michaels-Menten constant for O_2 consumption and CO_2 evolution, % O_2 respectively, $K_{i(O2)}$ and $K_{i(CO2)}$ are the inhibition constants for O_2 consumption, CO_2 evolution, % CO_2 respectively. In the above expression, the O_2 and CO_2 concentration are expressed in percentage. The effect of O_2 and CO_2 on respiration rate in terms of ml $[O_2]$ kg⁻¹h⁻¹ and ml $[CO_2]$ kg⁻¹h⁻¹ can be obtained from the above equations (10) and (11) respectively.

The parameters of the above equations (10) and (11) may be estimated by linearization of the equation and subsequent linear regression analysis (Andrich *et al.* 1991; Lee *et al.* 1991; Hagger *et al.* 1992; Song *et al.* 1992; Lee *et al.* 1996; Andrich *et al.* 1998; Mclaughlin and O'Beirne 1999; Mahajan and Goswami 2001; Das 2007; Bhande *et al.* 2008) or directly by non-linear regression analysis (Cameron *et al.* 1994; Joles *et al.* 1994; Dadzie *et al.* 1996; Peppelenbos and Leven 1996; Ratti *et al.* 1996; Smyth *et al.* 1998). However, linearising the equations is equivalent to changing the weight given to the data in the estimation procedure and thus should be avoided (Peppelenbos and Leven 1996; Fonseca *et al.* 2002).

Temperature is the most important environmental factor in the post harvest life of fresh produce because of its dramatic effect on rates of biological reaction including respiration. Within the physiological range (0 to 30° C), the respiration rate of fresh fruits and vegetables generally increases two to three folds for every 10° C rise in temperature (Wills *et al.* 1989). The Arrhenius relationship describes the dependence of the biological reactions, including respiration of fresh produce, on temperature. The activated complex theory for chemical rates is the basis for the Arrhenius equation, which relates reaction rates to the absolute temperature (Toledo 1991). Temperature has also major effect on the respiration rate, which has not been considered in the equation of the uncompetitive inhibition of enzyme kinetics (equations 10 and 11). As per the studies conducted by Bhande *et al.* (2008), Das (2007),

Hong *et al.* (2001) and Lakakul *et al.* (1999) on banana, sapota fruit, fresh-cut green onion and sapota slices respectively, a model parameter V_m of Michaels-Menten type enzyme kinetics was found to vary with the storage temperature. They used Arrhenius plot to describe the relationship between V_m and storage temperature. The dependence of model parameters of uncompetitive inhibition kinetics on storage temperature can be expressed by equation (12) (Lakakul *et al.* 1999). The model parameters obtained for apple were then correlated at different temperatures using Arrhenius plot as shown in equation (12).

$$R_{m} = R_{p} \exp\left[\frac{-E_{a}}{R \times T_{abs}}\right]$$
(12)

where R_m is the model parameter of enzyme kinetics, R_p is the respiration pre-exponential factor, E_a is the activation energy, kJ/g-mole, T_{abs} is the storage temperature, K, and R is the Universal gas constant (8.314 kJ/kg-mole-K). Equation (12) can be expressed in a linearised form (Forward 1960) as shown in equation (13).

$$\ln R_{\rm m} = -\frac{-E_{\rm a}}{R} \left[\frac{1}{T_{\rm abs}} \right] + \ln R_{\rm p}$$
⁽¹³⁾

Verification of the model

Respiration rates of Royal Delicious apple predicted by model were verified with experimental respiration rates at 12 °C storage temperature. The respiration data for O_2 and CO_2 were obtained by the closed system respirometer kept at 12°C. Free volume of respirometer and weight of apple taken for verification of the model were 4451.27 ml and 1.367 kg, respectively. The experimental respiration rates for apple at different combinations of O_2 and CO_2 at 12°C temperature were determined using equations (2) and (3), respectively.

Statistical analysis

The SYSTAT 8.0 software was used to determine the values of the regression coefficients (a and b) of equations (4) and (5) along with their coefficients of determination. Similarly the model parameters of enzyme kinetic model (equations 10 and 11) were estimated along with their coefficients of determination. The one-way ANOVA was carried out to ascertain the effect of temperature on the model parameters and effect of temperature on regression coefficients using SYSTAT 8.0 with a completely randomized block design.

Goodness of fit

The mean relative percentage deviation modulus is widely adopted throughout the literature to evaluate the goodness of fit of mathematical expression. Moduli below 10% are indicative of reasonably good fit, 10–20% fairly good fit and 20–30% not satisfactory fit for all practical purposes. The goodness of fit between predicted and experimental respiration rates was obtained by calculating the mean relative percentage deviation modulus (McLaughlin and O'Beirne 1999) as given in equation 14. In general, lower the modulus better is the agreement between experimental and predicted values.

$$E = \left[\frac{100}{N} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \frac{(R_{exp} - R_{pre})}{R_{exp}}\right]$$
(14)

where, E is the mean relative deviation modulus in %; N is the number of respiration data points; R_{exp} is the experimental respiration rate in ml kg⁻¹ h⁻¹and R_{pre} is the predicted respiration rate in ml kg⁻¹ h⁻¹.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The physico-chemical properties of Royal Delicious apple as obtained experimentally are shown in **Table 2**. The phy-

 Table 2 Free volume of respirometer and weight of apple taken for generating the respiration data.

Storage temperature	Weight of fruits	Free volume of
(°C)	(W), kg	respirometer (V _f), ml
0	1.378	4440.84
5	1.352	4466.25
10	1.382	4436.78
15	1.309	4515.32
20	1.371	4446.57
25	1.327	4493.82
30	1.332	4485.36

sico-chemical properties obtained were found to be in agreement with those reported by Kaushal and Sharma (1995), Ghosh (1999) and Mahajan (2001).

Fig. 2 shows the periodical changes in O_2 and CO_2 concentrations inside the closed respirometer containing apple at different storage temperatures. The O_2 concentration of the respirometer decreased in proportion to increase in CO_2 concentration with the storage period, the rate being higher at the higher storage temperature.

Estimation of parameter for different models

Model 1

The regression coefficients a, and b of equations (4) and (5), and coefficients of determination (r^2) at different storage temperatures are shown in **Table 3**. The above regression functions described the experimental data very well ($r^2 \ge 0$. 996) for apple.

From the values of the regression coefficients a and b in **Table 3**, it can be inferred that both parameters were influenced by the storage temperature and that coefficient b was more influenced by temperature than coefficient a. The analysis of variance of temperature with regression coefficients a and b of Model 1 is given in **Table 4**. It can be inferred that temperature has a significant effect (1% level of significance) on regression coefficients. For any unknown temperature, the values of a and b can be determined by linear interpolation of the known values. The corresponding values of a and b, when substituted in equation (6) and (7), allow to estimate dY_{O2}/dt and dZ_{CO2}/dt , respectively. The respiration rates for the given temperature can then be determined using equations (8) and (9).

Model 2

The model parameters in equations (10) and (11) were determined by fitting the experimental data at each temperature using non-linear regression analysis (SYSTAT 8.0, SPSS). According to equation (10) and (11), respiration rate was considered as the dependent variable whereas the O₂ concentration (Y_{O2}) and CO_2 concentration (Z_{CO2}) were considered as the independent variables for the regression analysis. The model parameters were calculated from the constants of non-linear regression analysis, which are given in Table 5 along with their corresponding coefficients of determination (r^{Z}) values. The values in **Table 5** show that the model parameters were indeed dependent on the storage temperature. The coefficients of determinations was found to be higher or equal to 0.970 indicating that the relationship between respiration rate and O₂ and CO₂ concentrations fitted well with the uncompetitive inhibition enzyme kinetics model.

The analysis of variance of temperature with model parameters of enzyme kinetics model is given in **Table 6**. It can be inferred that the temperature has a significant effect (1% level of significance) on model parameters $V_{m(O2)}$, $V_{m(CO2)}$, $K_{m(O2)}$, $K_{m(CO2)}$, $K_{m(CO2)}$, $K_{i(O2)}$ and $K_{i(CO2)}$ of enzyme kinetics Model 2.

Since the model parameters such as $V_{m_n} K_m$ and K_i for O_2 and CO_2 concentrations were found to vary with tempe-



Fig. 2 Experimental data for O₂ consumption and CO₂ evolution at different temperatures. ▲ is Y₀₂, in decimal; ■ is Z_{c02}, in decimal.

Storage temperature of apple (°C)	Respiration expression in terms of	Reg	r ²	
		a	b	
0	O ₂ consumption	3.192	321.888	0.998
	CO ₂ evolution	3.242	309.27	0.999
5	O ₂ consumption	3.109	262.883	0.997
	CO ₂ evolution	3.115	258.511	0.996
10	O ₂ consumption	3.158	209.180	0.997
	CO_2 evolution	3.169	206.409	0.998
15	O_2 consumption	3.510	145.413	0.997
	CO ₂ evolution	3.542	142.157	0.996
20	O ₂ consumption	3.665	110.360	0.998
	CO ₂ evolution	3.679	108.835	0.997
25	O ₂ consumption	3.392	94.393	0.997
	CO_2 evolution	3.475	92.217	0.996
30	O ₂ consumption	3.418	69.887	0.998
	CO ₂ evolution	3.379	69.313	0.997

Table 3 Values of Regression Coefficients for Model 1.	
--	--

 Table 4 Analysis of variance of effect of temperature on regression coefficients of Model 1.

Factor	DF		a ₀₂	a _{CO2}			b _{O2}	b _{CO2}		
		MSS	F value	MSS	F value	MSS	F value	MSS	F value	
Replication	2	0.00	0.01	0.00	0.01	471.76	0.99	0.14	0.12	
Temperature	6	0.12	30.51**	0.13	30.64**	34345.24	72.69**	24647.10	21439.06**	
Error	12	0.004		0.004		472.48		1.15		
** Significant at	1% level									

rature and hence, Arrhenius equation was used to correlate the model parameters at different storage temperatures. As per equation (13) the model parameters were plotted at different storage temperatures; by plotting the log values of the model parameters against the inverse of corresponding temperature in absolute units. The resulting linear plot is shown as Fig. 3. The slope and the Y-axis intercept of equation (13) for model parameters $V_{m,i} K_m$ and K_i are shown in Table 7. The activation energy was calculated from the slope of the straight line and the pre-exponential factor was calculated from the Y-axis intercept. Table 8 shows the activation energy and pre-exponential factor for different model parameters of enzyme kinetics. Activation energy was found to be in negative side for $K_{i(O2)}$ and $K_{i(CO2)}$ valued at -20.23 and -16.84 kJ/g-mole respectively. The negative values of activation energies for K_i could be attributed to the

 Table 5 Model parameters for uncompetitive inhibition enzyme kinetics for different storage temperatures (Model 2).

Storage temperature (°C)	Respiration expressed in terms of	V _m (ml/kg h)	K _m (% O ₂)	K _i (% CO ₂)	r^2
0	O ₂	12.69	4.20	13.73	0.994
	CO_2	15.44	9.43	15.14	0.992
5	O_2	14.78	5.43	10.65	0.982
	CO_2	17.63	10.22	13.58	0.990
10	O ₂	17.25	7.13	9.36	0.972
	CO_2	21.15	11.37	11.92	0.983
15	O_2	22.74	8.16	7.88	0.980
	CO_2	25.27	12.26	10.66	0.970
20	O_2	28.25	9.23	7.17	0.975
	CO_2	32.16	13.87	9.20	0.985
25	O_2	33.21	9.84	6.22	0.991
	CO_2	36.20	14.65	8.30	0.985
30	O_2	43.57	10.26	5.46	0.990
	CO_2	45.62	15.53	7.28	0.991

 Table 6 Analysis of variance of effect of temperature on model parameters of Enzyme kinetics model (Model 2).

Factor	DF	V	n(O2)	Vn	n(CO2	K	-m(O2)	K	m(CO2)	ŀ	K _{i(O2}	K	i(CO2)
		MSS	F value	MSS	F value	MSS	F value	MSS	F value	MSS	F value	MSS	F value
Replication	2	0.18	0.14	0.13	0.11	0.14	0.12	0.13	0.11	0.14	0.12	0.13	0.11
Temperature	6	371.53	390.10**	357.10	311.38**	15.70	13.77**	15.84	14.00**	24.58	21.48**	24.51	25.76**
Error	12	1.12		1.14		1.14		1.13		1.14		1.12	
** Significant	at 1% le	vel											

* Significant at 5% level



Fig. 3 Arrhenius relation for different model parameters of enzyme kinetics. A is $V_{m(O2)}$; \blacksquare $V_{m(CO2)}$; \blacklozenge is $K_{m(O2)}$; \Box is $K_{i(CO2)}$.

inhibitory effect of CO_2 concentration on respiration rate. By using these constants, the model parameters at any temperatures can be predicted by using equation (12) and then,



Fig. 4 Experimentally estimated and predicted respiration rates for Royal Delicious apple at 12°C. \longrightarrow is for experimental respiration rate; -- \square -- is for respiration rate predicted by Model 1; -- \triangle -- is for respiration rate predicted by Model 2.

the respiration rate at the given temperature can be estimated by employing equation (10) and (11) for respiration rates in terms of O_2 consumption and CO_2 evolution, respectively.

Verification of the models

Since the respiration rates were generated at temperature between 0 to 30°C with a 5°C step it was necessary to verify whether the developed models were capable of predicting the respiration rates at any temperature within this domain of experimental temperatures. Accordingly, the respiration rates predicted by the models were verified with the experimental respiration rate at 12°C storage temperature.

For Model 1, the values of the regression coefficient a

Table 7 Slope (-E_a/R) and Y axis intercept (ln R_p) of Arrhenius relation for different model parameters of enzyme kinetics.

		$\mathbf{V}_{\mathbf{m}}$		K _m		K _i		
	O ₂	CO ₂	O_2	CO ₂	O_2	CO ₂		
Slope	-3428.3	-3014.4	-2460.3	-1429.6	2434.2	2025.9		
Y axis intercept	15.036	13.734	10.557	7.478	-6.350	-4.686		
<u>r</u> ²	0.992	0.989	0.932	0.993	0.989	0.997		

Table 8 Activation energy and pre-exponential factor of Arrhenius-type equation for different model parameters of uncompetitive inhibition.

Parameters for Arrhenius equation		Vm		K _m		Ki		
	O ₂	CO ₂	O_2	CO ₂	O_2	CO ₂		
E _a (kJ/g-mole)	28.50	25.06	20.45	11.88	-20.23	-16.84		
R _p	3.3×10^{6}	1.0×10^{6}	3.8×10^4	1.8×10^{3}	$1.7 imes 10^{-3}$	1.0×10^{-2}		

and b at 12° C were estimated by the linear interpolation of the values of the same coefficients at 10 and 15° C as shown in **Table 3**. By using activation energy and pre exponential factor from **Table 6**, the model parameters for enzyme kinetics at 12° C for both O₂ consumption and CO₂ evolution were calculated and the respiration rate at 12° C was predicted using equations (10) and (11).

The comparison of regression analysis (Model 1) and enzyme kinetics model (Model 2) with temperature dependence based on Arrhenius law against the experimentally determined respiration rate at 12°C is depicted in **Fig. 4**.

The mean relative deviation moduli (equation (14) between the respiration rates of apple at 12°C predicted by regression analysis (Model 1) and that obtained through experiments were 1.97 and 2.10% for O_2 consumption and CO_2 evolution, respectively. Similarly the mean relative deviation moduli between the respiration rates predicted by model based on enzyme kinetics (Model 2) and obtained through experiments were found to be 12.82 and 15% for O_2 consumption and CO_2 evolution, respectively. The results indicate that both the models have good agreements for predicting the respiration rates for O_2 consumption and CO_2 evolution.

The respiration rates measured for Royal Delicious apple was found to be lower than that found for the other fruits such as mango (Menon Rekha and Goswami 2008), sapota (Das 2007), and banana (Bhande *et al.* 2008). The respiration rates and the parameters of enzyme kinetics model were found to be in agreement with those found by Mahajan (2001). The goodness of fit obtained for Model 1 and Model 2 were found to be within the range reported for mango (Menon Rekha and Goswami 2008), sapota (Das 2007), and banana (Bhande *et al.* 2008).

CONCLUSIONS

Respiration rates for apple at different temperatures form 0– 30 °C in steps of 5 °C were estimated using the closed system method. The respiration rates were found to decrease with storage time due to diminishing concentrations of O_2 and proportional increase in CO_2 concentrations in the respirometer. In the enzyme kinetics model, the dependence of respiration rate on O_2 and CO_2 was found to follow the uncompetitive inhibition. The activation energy and pre-exponential factors of the Arrhenius equations were used for predicting the model parameters of enzyme kinetics at any temperature between 0-30 °C.

The mean relative deviation moduli between the respiration rates of apple at 12°C predicted by both models were within 15% for O_2 consumption and CO_2 evolution. This indicates that both models have good agreements for predicting the respiration rates for O_2 consumption and CO_2 evolution. However the Enzyme kinetics model (Model 2) is preferred because principles of enzyme kinetics have been suggested as being applicable to the respiration rate of fresh produce.

REFERENCES

- Andrich G, Fiorentini R, Tuci A, Zinnai A, Sommovigo G (1991) A tentative model to describe respiration of stored apples. *Journal of the American Society for Horticultural Science* **116**, 478-481
- Andrich G, Zinnai A, Balzini S, Silvestri S, Fiorentini R (1998) Aerobic respiration rate of golden delicious apples as a function of temperature and pO₂. *Postharvest Biology and Technology* 14, 1-9
- Bhande SD, Ravindran MR, Goswami TK (2008) Respiration rates of banana fruits under aerobic conditions at different storage temperatures. *Journal of Food Engineering* 87 (1), 116-123
- Burzo I (1980) Influence of temperature level on respiratory intensity in the main vegetable varieties. Acta Horticulturae 116, 61-64
- Cameron AC, Boylan-Pett W, Lee J (1989) Design of modified atmosphere packaging systems: modeling oxygen concentrations within sealed packages of tomato fruits. *Journal of Food Science* 54 (6), 1413-1415, 1421
- Cameron AC, Beaudry RM, Banks NH, Yelanich MV (1994) Modified atmosphere packaging of blueberry fruit: modeling respiration and package oxygen partial pressures as a function of temperature. *Journal of the American Society for Horticultural Science* 119, 534-539
- Chadha KL (1978) Three decades of research in fruits-III. Temperate fruits. Indian Horticulture 23 (2), 13
- Cornish-Bowden A (1979) Fundamentals of Enzyme Kinetics, Butterworth Ltd., London, 343 pp
- Dadzie BK, Banks NH, Cleland DJ, Hewett EW (1996) Changes in respiration and ethylene production of apples in response to internal and external oxygen partial pressures. *Postharvest Biology and Technology* 9, 297-309
- Dash KK (2007) Modelling of respiration kinetics of fruits for control atmosphere storage and modified atmosphere storage. Unpublished M.Tech thesis, Department of Agriculture and Food Engineering, Indian Institute of Technology, Kharagpur, India
- Fidler JC, North CJ (1967) The effect of conditions of storage on the respiration of apples. I. The effects of temperature and concentrations of carbon dioxide and oxygen on the production of carbon dioxide and uptake of oxygen. *Journal of Horticultural Science* 42, 189-206
- **Fonseca SC, Oliveira FAR, Brecht JK** (2002) Modelling of respiration rate of fresh fruits and vegetables for modified atmosphere packages: a review. *Journal of Food Engineering* **52**, 99-119
- Forward DF (1960) Effect of temperature on respiration. *Encyclopedia of Plant Physiology* **12 (2)**, 234-258
- **Ghosh SP** (1999) Deciduous fruit production in India. In: Papdemetriou MK, Herath EM (Eds) *Deciduous Fruit Production in the Asia-Pacific*, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations Regional Office for Asia and Pacific (FAO/RAP publications), Bangkok, Thailand, pp 65-87
- Gupta GK (1987) Apple scab and its management. Indian Horticulture 32 (1), 48
- Hagger PE, Lee DS, Yam KL (1992) Application of an enzyme kinetic based respiration model to closed system experiments for fresh produce. *Journal of Food Process Engineering* 15, 143-157
- Hong SI, Kim DM (2001) Influence of oxygen concentration and temperature on respiratory characteristics of fresh cut green onion. *International Journal* of Food Science and Technology 36 (3), 283-289
- Ingale M, D'Souza MC (1989) Fruit characteristics of Red delicious apple strains during maturation and storage. *Journal of the American Society for Horticultural Science* 114 (5), 776
- Irtwange SV (2006) Application of modified atmosphere packaging and related technology in postharvest handling of fresh fruits and vegetables. *Agricultural Engineering International*: the CIGR Ejournal. Invited Overview No. 4, Vol VIII, 13 pp
- Joles DW, Cameron AC, Shirazi A, Petracek PD, Beaudry RM (1994) Modified atmosphere packaging of 'Heritage' red raspberry fruit: respiratory response to reduced oxygen, enhanced carbon dioxide and temperature. *Journal* of the American Society for Horticultural Science **119**, 540-545
- Kader AA, Zagory D, Kerbel EL (1989) Modified atmosphere packaging of fruits and vegetables. *Critical Reviews in Food Science and Nutrition* 28, 1-30

- Kang JS, Lee DS (1998) A kinetic model for transpiration of fresh produce in a controlled atmosphere. *Journal of Food Engineering* 35, 65-73
- Kays SJ (1991) Metabolic processes in harvested products respiration. In: Post Harvest Physiology of Perishable Plant Products, Van Nostrand Reinhold Publication, New York, pp 47-56
- Kaul JL, Gupta VK (1987) Diseases of temperate horticultural crops. Indian Horticulture 32 (1), 40-47
- Kaushal BB, Anand JC (1986) Recent trials on grading and packaging of apples. *Indian Food Packer* 40 (2), 29
- Kaushal BB Lal, Sharma PC (1995) Apple. In: DD Salunkhe, SS Kadam (Eds) *Handbook of Fruit Science and Technology*, Marcel Dekker Inc., New York, pp 91-122
- Lakakul R, Beaudry RM, Hernandez RJ (1999) Modelling respiration of apple slices in modified atmosphere packages. *Journal Food Science* 64 (1), 105-110
- Lee DS, Hagger PE, Lee J, Yam KL (1991) Model for fresh produce respiration in modified atmosphere based on principles of enzyme kinetics. *Journal* of Food Science 56 (6), 1580-1585
- Lee DS, Song Y, Yam KL (1996) Application of an enzyme kinetics based respiration model to permeable system experiment of fresh produce. *Journal* of Food Engineering 27, 297-310
- Mahajan PV, Goswami T (2001) Enzyme kinetics based modeling of respiration rate for apple. *Journal of Agricultural Engineering Research* 79 (4), 399-406
- Mahajan PV (2001) Studies on control atmosphere storage for apple and litchi using liquid nitrogen. Unpublished PhD thesis, Department of Agriculture and Food Engineering, Indian Institute of Technology, Kharagpur, India, 193 pp
- Mangaraj S, Varshney AC (2006) Fruit grading in India a review. Indian Food Industry 25 (3), 46-52
- Maneerat C, Tongta A, Kanlayanarat S, Wongs-Aree C (1997) A transient model to predict O₂ and CO₂ concentrations in modified atmosphere packaging of bananas at various temperatures. In: Gorny JR (Ed) Proceedings of the 7th International Controlled Atmosphere Research Conference (Vol 5), UC Davis, CA, USA, pp 191-197
- McLaughlin CP, O'Beirne D (1999) Respiration rate of a dry coleslaw mix as affected by storage temperature and respiratory gas concentrations. *Journal* of Food Science 64 (1), 116-119
- Menon Rekha Ravindran, Goswami TK (2008) Modelling of respiration rates of green matures mango under aerobic conditions. *Biosystems Engineering* 99 (2), 239-248
- **Meyer BS, Anderson DB, Bohling RH, Fratianne DG** (1973) *Introduction to Plant Physiology* (2nd Edn), Van Nostrand, Princeton, New Jersey, USA, 565 pp

- Parry RT (1993) Principles and Applications of Modified Atmosphere Packaging of Foods, Blackie Academic & Professional, London, England, 332 pp
- Peppelenbos HW, Van't Leven J (1996) Evaluation of four types of inhibition for modeling the influence of carbon dioxide on oxygen consumption fruits and vegetables. *Postharvest Biology and Technology* 7, 27-40
- Prasad M (1995) Development of modified atmosphere packaging system with permselective films for storage of red delicious apples. Unpublished PhD thesis, Department of Agriculture and Food Engineering, Indian Institute of Technology, Kharagpur, India, 203 pp
- Raghavan GSV, Gariepy Y (1985) Structure and instrumentation aspects of storage systems. Acta Horticulturae 157, 5-30
- Ranganna S (1995) Hand Book of Analysis and Quality Control for Fruits and Vegetable Products, Tata McGraw Pub. Co., New Delhi, India, 1112 pp
- Ratti C, Raghavan GSV, Gariepy Y (1996) Respiration rate model and modified atmosphere packaging of fresh cauliflower. *Journal of Food Engineering* 28, 297-306
- Ryall AL, Pentzer WT (1982) Handling, Transportation and Storage of Fruits and Vegetables (2nd Edn, Vol II), The AVI Publishing Co., Inc., Westport, Connecticut, 323 pp
- Singh R, Pant PC, Singh MV, Adhikari KS (1978) Responses of apple var. Royal Delicious to different ratio of NPK. *Progress in Horticulture* 10 (2), 29
- Smyth AB, Song J, Cameron AC (1998) Modified atmosphere packaged cut iceberg lettuce: effect of temperature and O₂ partial pressure on respiration and quality. *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry* 46, 4556-4562
- Song Y, Kim HK, Yam KL (1992) Respiration rate of blueberry in modified atmosphere at various temperatures. *Journal of the American Society for Horticultural Science* 117, 925-929
- Stiles ME (1991) Scientific principles of controlled/modified atmosphere packaging. In: Ooraikul B, Stiles ME (Eds) Modified Atmosphere Packaging of Food, Ellis Horwood Ltd., New York, NY, pp 18-25
- **Talasila PC, Chau KV, Brecht JK** (1992) Effects of gas concentrations and temperature on O₂ consumption of strawberries. *Transactions of the ASAE* **35** (1), 221-224
- **Toledo RT** (1991) Kinetics of chemical reactions in foods. *Fundamentals of Food Processing Engineering*, Chapman and Hall Inc., New York, 427 pp
- Varshney AC, Mangaraj S, Birla SL (2002) Fruit Grading Practices Status and Future Assessment, Technical Bulletin, CIAE, Bhopal, India, 35 pp
- Wills RBH, McGlasson WB, Graham D, Lee TH, Hall EG (1989) Postharvest: An Introduction to the Physiology and Handling of Fruits and Vegetables, Chapman and Hall, Inc., New York, 218 pp
- Yang CC, Chinnan MS (1988) Modeling the effect of O₂ and CO₂ on respiration and quality of stored tomatoes. *Transactions of the ASAE* **30** (3), 920-925
- Zagory D, Kader AA (1988) Modified atmosphere packaging of fresh produce. Food Technology 42 (9), 70-77

Notation used in this manuscript

а	Regression coefficient
b	Regression coefficient, h
Е	Mean relative deviation modulus, %
Ea	Activation energy, kJ g ⁻¹ mol ⁻¹
K _{m(O2)}	Michaelis-Menten constant for O2 consumption, % O2
K _{m(CO2)}	Michaelis-Menten constant for CO2 evolution, % O2
K _{i(O2)}	Inhibition constants for O2 consumption, % CO2
K _{i(CO2)}	Inhibition constants for CO2 evolution, % CO2
Ν	Number of respiration data points
Ni	Initial N ₂ concentration of the respirometer, %.
$N_{\rm f}$	Final N ₂ concentration of the respirometer, %.
Q _N	Volume of N ₂ injected into the respiration chamber, cm ³
R	Universal gas constant, 8.314 kJ kg ⁻¹ mol ⁻¹ K ⁻¹
R _{CO2}	Respiration rate, ml [CO ₂] kg ⁻¹ h ⁻¹
Rexp	Experimental respiration rate, ml kg ⁻¹ h ⁻¹
R _m	Model parameter of enzyme kinetic
R _{pre}	Predicted respiration rate, ml kg ⁻¹ h ⁻¹
R _{O2}	Respiration rate, ml [O ₂] kg ⁻¹ h ⁻¹
R _p	Respiration pre-exponential factor
Т	Storage temperature, °C
T _{abs}	Storage temperature, K
t	Storage time, h
Δt	Time difference between two gas measurements
$V_{\rm f}$	Free volume of the respiration chamber, ml
V _{m(CO2)}	Maximum respiration rate for CO2 evolution, ml/kg-h
V _{m(O2)}	Maximum respiration rate for O2 consumption, ml/kg-h
W	Weight of Royal Delicious apple fruit, kg
Y _{O2}	Oxygen concentration, decimal
Z _{CO2}	Carbon dioxide concentration, decimal